

I.A.R.I.W.



Conference on  
**Experiences and Challenges in Measuring Income,  
Inequality, and Poverty in South Asia**

New Delhi

November 23-25, 2017

Supported by:  THE WORLD BANK

**Migration, Mobility and Marginalization of the Labour in South  
Asia: From the Perspectives of Bangladeshi Domestic Workforce in  
India**

Natasha Israt Kabir  
Jahangirnagar University and BRIDGE Foundation, Bangladesh

Paper prepared for the IARIW-ICIER Conference

New Delhi, India, November 23-25, 2017

Session 4: Migration

Time: Friday, November 24, 2017 [Morning]

## **Abstract:**

The paper aims to overview the perspectives of both types of migration. Jagori, a Delhi based NGO has carried out a survey which finds that the majority of these people are illiterate or barely literate with no formal schooling. In Gurgaon, most of the house maids (domestic workers), rickshaw-pullers and construction workers are illegal Muslim migrants from Bangladesh. The extent of the illegal aliens can be seen from the fact that every maid, rickshaw puller and laborer here speak the Sylhet language or Chittagong language, both of which are native to Bangladesh, rather than India.

## **Key Words:**

South Asian, Domestic work force, Rights based approaches, legal and illegal, Bangladeshi migrant workers

## **Rationale/significance of this research**

Why scaling up the Approaches for the victim terms of domestic workers who migrated having work permit can extend benefits to larger scale in terms of their participation, Strategic decision making in Social Movement organizations being documented or not being documented

## **Broad Objective:**

To explore how are gendered experiences of victimized migration and identities shaped and the intervention of gendered forms of participation in broader perspectives of rights based campaign in South Asian Social Movement as comparative studies in that dimensions of being domestic workers and having legal documents becomes symbolic victim of border repression as we have seen in the case of Felani : A Tragic Death and which has become a part of social movement in Bangladesh against border killing.

## **Specific Objectives:**

1. To find out how domestic workforce in migration and mobility have impacted in terms of social movement and had been addressed in rights based approaches
2. To examine how domestic workforce in migration; and victimization of Gender as an intervention in rights based legal approaches campaign in Social Movement have been focused so far in India
3. To analyze how systems of victimization of domestic migration shaped lived experiences in visual and cultural resources as sexual and rights based health campaign based social movement.
4. To aware the intellectuals on the issue of human trafficking in the name of domestic migrant's workforce and its results. ·
5. To provide an opportunity to share experiences and link up with organisations already working on human trafficking and domestic migrants' workforce in India, Bangladesh and Nepal. ·

6. To facilitate the identification of areas of work on rights based approaches for legal workforce for future actions, ·

7. To provide an opportunity for capacity building in advocacy and research on Migrant work force and stand against trafficking in South Asia.

8. Rehabilitation, Reintegration and Repatriation of Victims.

## **Research Questions**

How the identical movement is managed and maintained across boundaries of religion, race, class, and culture?

As a form of migration in domestic workforce and the experiences of such coerced migrants in various times and places, focusing on such topics gendered persecution and depiction in film and literature and how it has become influential in campaign through the NGOs and Rights based Activists?

What are the key factors have been covered in the gendered discourse and forms of resilience and creativity, the intersection of gender and sexuality in migrants workforce based migration and victimization of Gender as an intervention in rights based campaign and in Rights based legal approaches as well?

## **Research Methodology**

The methods to be followed for the research are interviews, group facilitation, and field observations to observe the actual tool, activities, knowledge. A visual report (such as photo-stories) will be established in addition to the dissertation as the report for such fieldwork. It would be qualitative and partially quantitative.

### **The methods that has been followed:**

1. Literature and Film Review
2. Case study-
3. Comparative study between the 2 countries.

Using ethnographic fieldwork, including interviews with workers in three of the countries for investigation and structural interventions addressing rights based approaches among Delhi based workforce who exchanged their point of views.

Secondary Resources:

1. Review of existing literature and Film
2. Comparative study

## **Ethical Issues:**

All the exclusive interviews based on case studies will not be revealed without the documented consent letter of the interviewees.

## **Introduction**

If one asks them (Bangladeshi Migrant Domestic Workforce), however, these immigrants simply lie that they are from West Bengal. These lies commonly ground detected by most Gurgaon residents who cannot tell the difference between the Bengali dialects. Many of these Bangladeshi Muslims are being employed as maid-servants by the wealthy expatriates and busy professionals because they ask for lesser wages than local Hindus.

Everyone introduced him or herself as an Indian citizen from different states of India. The Delhi police's target these illegal migrants as well as legal Bangladeshi Muslim migrants.

Meanwhile, the legal migrant domestic workers also face trouble, as they do not have a common organizational forum. Sister Ranjeetha from the Domestic Workers Forum says that prior to the establishment of this forum workers did not have anywhere to discuss their rights or problems related to exploitation, low salary, ill-treatment, or lack of holiday, proper food and shelter.

Surprisingly it was not a South Asian who established this forum. It was a Belgian Nun who came to know about these issues directly from the suffering workers. Mostly the victims are the women. Sister Ranjeetha also stated that they are mostly working on the basis of 'National Workers Rights', as the Indian government has ratified the convention of ILO. Very few case studies of Nepalese and Bangladeshi migrant workers dealing with their rights are available, since they are either unaware of them or afraid to come forward. The forum is focusing, therefore, on an awareness campaign to make the families who employ these workers aware. Some of these families are cooperative, but some are exploitative and violate the rules and regulations even when they do know them.

## **Types of Migration, How, Where and Why?**

Discussion below provide insights to the questions 1) What types of migration are taking place 2) Why is migration happened? 3) How is it happened and 4) Where can it be seen.

## **Return Migration**

According to the definition offered by the United Nations Statistics Division for collecting data on international (UNSD, 1998), returning migrants are "persons returning to their country of citizenship after having been international migrants (whether short- term or long term) in another country and who are intending to stay in their own country for at least a year." This definition embraces four dimensions:

- i) country of origin,
- ii) place of residence abroad,

- iii) length of stay in the host country, and
- iv) length of stay in the home country after return

## **Causes of Migration**

There is an extensive literature on the causes of migration, which identifies a wide range of economic, social and political factors of importance. Migration can have on improving or deteriorating welfare for migrants and non-migrants at destination and source over time. Poverty may induce people to migrate in order to improve their livelihoods but may in turn result in them becoming further impoverished and more vulnerable. Discussed below are few of the causes that have been identified by literature as the causes of migration.

## **Social Protection**

The World Bank defines social protection in terms of three components: social services, labour market conditions, and social network. Social services include “health care benefits, long-term social security benefits like old-age and disability benefits, and short-term benefits like social assistance, maternity, and unemployment benefits, family allowances as well as public housing and education” (Avato et. al 2009). Migration hence can happen from developing countries where the social security system is not well-developed or non-existent to the developed countries in which such systems are developed and have a guarantee of access.

.

## **Social capital:**

Social capital is often cited as a significant determinant of population mobility, particularly due to segmentation of migration streams between specific regions of origin and destination due to kinship and other networks (De Haan 1999)

## **Human Capital:**

In terms of education, skills, knowledge, age and health determines access to economic opportunities. Individual human capital therefore has long been seen as a key determinant of migration. Probability, and there is a significant amount of evidence indicating that those with better education and skills have a comparative advantage in destination labor markets and are more likely to migrate (Lucas 1997). Whereas we have seen domestic migrants are more prone to vulnerability due to lack of education, skills, knowledge and being an ultimate victim of poverty and that becomes the force behind their migration for domestic work purpose which has become easiest and viable solution even though their rights in terms of age, gender, food, working environment, wage and health are very often denied.

## **Geography:**

Those with limited access to environmental capital including natural and common property resources, or who live in risky natural environments, may be compelled to undertake migration as a livelihood diversification strategy. Poor people in geographically remote communities may be particularly vulnerable to external shocks where they have limited access to alternative livelihood strategies such as migration, due to being confronted with higher costs of travel to destination and lack of established social networks with destination communities.

## **Political capital:**

Enables population mobility, most obviously through citizenship, allowing internal and external movement. The poor are more likely to be politically marginalized, and therefore by definition restricted from influencing existing migration policies that are more likely to restrict than promote movement (De Haan 1999)

### **Case Study of Bangladeshi Migrant Workers Juggi Basti in Delhi**

The 1st and 2nd generation Bangladeshi Migrant, Mohammad Suleiman (21), his mother Ayesha khatun (40), Nusrat Parveen (19) have been living in Juggi Basti (Slums) more than 20 years but still now they are not documented and threats factors are mainly concerned with the police and political parties. The most important fact which sums up and that is being a dependable vote bank to the parties they are highly demanding and documentation hardly matters and rights factors have become a bit of trivial in their lives and livelihood

## **Migration as a problem to be addressed**

Sexual exploitation;

Adoption;

Child labour (e.g., domestic work, begging, criminal work like selling drugs);

Participation in armed conflicts;

Marriage;

Camel racing;

## Organ trade

The victims of trafficking or their caregivers are often seeking escape from poverty. The children most likely to be trafficked are girls, those from tribal groups and ethnic minorities, stateless people and refugees (according to the UN special rapporteur).

Some children (or their parents) are lured by promises of education, a new skill or a "good job"; other children are kidnapped outright, taken from their home villages or towns and then bought and sold like commodities. Often, they are crammed into boats or trucks without enough air, water or food. When their smugglers are threatened by discovery, the children may be abandoned or even killed. Children who are trafficked lose contact with their families. They are taken into an entirely new situation, often to another country, to a place where they don't know anyone and don't speak the language. They are vulnerable to many kinds of abuse, including sexual abuse. It is difficult for them to seek help not just because they are children but because they are often illegal immigrants and have false documents or no documents.

Different cultural situations produce different types of exploitation. In India, for example, the caste system and a history of bonded labour mean that tribal and low-caste children are more likely to be trafficked than others.

Poor economic conditions, poverty, unemployment, an upsurge in international organized crime, the low status of girls, lack of education, inadequate or non-existent legislation and/or poor law enforcement – all contribute to the increase in child trafficking. Trafficking becomes intensified in situations of war, natural disaster and lax regard for human rights.

### **“Wait, Men and Women are both the victims of domestic Migrant workforce and victimization is ended with women and girls being trafficked? The Typical Formulation of Stereotyping and Where to stop**

This type of disbelief and skepticism are typical reactions from those who hear about female migrant workforce as victims and on the other hand gendered relations in terms of being workforce where they do have their own justification. But in society's lens, the main focus is on women who might be forced into the sex industry. Today, we see that women are the ones frequently rescued, rehabilitated and reinstated back into society. The film and literature should also focus on those perspectives as well apart from traffickers versus trafficked stereotyping and objectification of victims through subjectivity of gender which is again about man and women, and victimization is all about being women. Still now we are struggling to find out the proper documentation of male or might be transgender victims as well being trafficked as sex slaves in India, Bangladesh and Nepal as our stereotyped mind set could not overcome the other ways of thinking.

## **References:**

Avato, J., J. Koettl, and R. Sabates-Wheeler (2009). "Definitions, Good Practices, and Global Estimates on the Status of Social Protection for International Migrants," "World Bank Social Protection Discussion Paper

Black R, Ammassari S, Hilker LM, Mouillesseaux S, Pooley C, Rajkotia R. 2004. Migration and pro-poor policies in sub-Saharan Africa, Department for International Development, London

De Haan 1999. 'Livelihoods and Poverty: The Role of Migration – A Critical Review of the Migration Literature', *Journal of Development Studies* 36 (2): 1-47"

Lucas, R. E. 1997. 'Internal Migration in Developing Countries', in M. Rosenzweig and O. Stark (eds.)

Leontidou, L 2001a: 'Methodological and pragmatological advances' (Chapter 6.1) in Leontidou, L, Afouxenidis, A, Donnan, H, Matias-Ferreira, V, Garcia-Lizana, A, Peraldi, X, Gasparini, A, Zago, M, and Gow, J *Border Cities and Towns: Causes of Social Exclusion in Peripheral Europe*, Brussels: European Commission. Targeted Socio-Economic Research (TSER) SOE2-CT97-3048

Massey Douglas 1999. 'Why Does Immigration Occur? A Theoretical Synthesis' in Charles De Windand Philip Kasinitz (eds) *The Handbook of International Migration: The American Experience*. New York: Russell Sage Foundation, pp 34-52.

Ortega, F., & G. Peri. 2009. —The Causes and Effects of International Labor Mobility: Evidence from OECD Countries 1980-2005. || Human Development Research Paper, No. 6, United Nations Development Program (UNDP), New York.

. Tienda M. & Jensen L. (1986) Immigration and public assistance participation: Dispelling the myth of dependency, *Social Science Research*, 15, 4, 372-400

United Nations Statistics Division (1998), *Recommendations on Statistics of International Migration*, Revision 1, United Nations, New York.

UNDP (United Nations Development Program). 2009. *Overcoming Barriers: Human Mobility and Development*. United Nations Development Program, New York

### **Internet Sources:**

<http://www.guardian.co.uk/global-development/2013/jan/31/bangladesh-women-india-freedom-cash>.

[www.gcim.org/attachment/gcim-complete-report-2005.pdf](http://www.gcim.org/attachment/gcim-complete-report-2005.pdf)